



**OAK RIDGE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
JUNE 19, 2019 – 7:00 P.M.
OAK RIDGE TOWN HALL**

MINUTES

Members Present

Debbie Shoenfeld, Chair
Caroline Ruch, Vice Chair
Kristin Kubly
Barbara Engel, Alternate (Sitting)

Staff Present

Sean Taylor, Planning Director
Sandra Smith, Town Clerk

Members Absent

Brian Hall
Paul Woolf

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

Chair Debbie Shoenfeld called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. She welcomed meeting attendees, then explained the purpose of the Commission, which is to promote restoration and preservation of historic structures in Oak Ridge. The review is to see that any proposed changes are compatible with the special character of the Historic District.

2. APPROVE AGENDA

Kristin Kubly made a motion to approve the meeting agenda. Barbara Engel seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (4-0).

3. APPROVE MINUTES

Kristin Kubly made a motion to approve the minutes of the May 15, 2019 regular meeting. Barbara Engel seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (4-0).

4. OLD BUSINESS

A. Town Council report.

Brian Hall gave the Commission's report at the May Town Council meeting, and Shoenfeld said she would give the report at the July meeting.

B. COAs reviewed/ approved at staff level.

None

C. COAs approved but not completed.

COAs outstanding are COA-19-01 for Domino's signage, COA-19-02 for Lionel & Meredith Shoffner's house, COA-19-03 for Philip Cooke/Rio Grande's building elevation changes, COA-19-05 for Gary and Myra Blackburn's fencing, COA-19-06 Matt and Brooke Kuzmick's new porch, COA-19-07 for Drew Donnell's project to replace the roof and repair the skylight, and COA-18-06 for Maple Glade at Oak Ridge Military Academy.

D. Design review meetings.

Shoenfeld reported that Caroline Ruch and she had met with Philip Cooke and architect Amanda Clift for a design review meeting.

E. Historic District violations.

None

5. NEW BUSINESS

Shoenfeld explained that the Commission would be following quasi-judicial procedures based on admitted evidence and sworn testimony. The suitability of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is based on conformance with the Design Guidelines and compatibility with the Historic District.

Shoenfeld said the Commission can only consider the size, scale, materials and other criteria described in the Design Guidelines. The Guidelines are intentionally broad to allow applicants a broad pathway toward compliance; the goal is to ensure that approved projects are compatible with the District and surrounding buildings. The Commission may approve, deny or continue consideration of a COA request, but a decision must be made within 180 days of the date the application was submitted. Appeals are heard by Oak Ridge Board of Adjustment; appeals from the Board of Adjustment are heard by Guilford County Superior Court.

Shoenfeld explained that Commission members should not engage in discussions with applicants regarding past or current COA applications and should not discuss the Commission's proceedings except with the Chair or Town staff.

Shoenfeld then explained what constituted a conflict of interest:

- A fixed opinion;
- Undisclosed *ex parte* communications with anyone about the case;
- A close familial, business or other relationship with an affected person; or
- A financial interest in the outcome of the case.

She asked if any Commission members had such a conflict with COA-19-03A for Philip Cooke/Rio Grande. Barbara Engel, Kristin Kubly, Caroline Ruch and Shoenfeld each individually indicated that they had no conflicts of interest. Shoenfeld stated that she and Caroline Ruch attended a design review meeting with COA applicant Philip Cooke, architect Amanda Clift, Planning Director Sean Taylor and Town Clerk/HPC Staff Sandra Smith.

COA-19-03A: Philip Cooke requests a COA for a covered outdoor patio and front door change at 2213 Oak Ridge Road, Oak Ridge, NC. The property is Guilford County Tax Parcel 166226, Oak Ridge Township, zoned CU-SC (Conditional Use-Shopping Center), SC (Scenic Corridor Overlay Zone), Historic District Overlay Zone. It is owned by Cooke Outparcel E, LLC.

Shoenfeld read the property description into the record and asked Commission members if they felt the project falls within the Design Guidelines and whether sufficient information has been submitted for the Commission to make a decision. Commission members Engel, Kubly, Ruch, and Shoenfeld all individually answered yes to the questions.

Shoenfeld asked Planning Director Sean Taylor if he wished to present the staff report, which is hereby incorporated by reference and made a part of the minutes. Taylor said there were no updates and the report stands as submitted.

Philip Cooke and Mandy Clift came forward and were sworn in. Cooke stated that they were present to ask approval for a covered patio and storefront doors at Rio Grande.

Clift stated that the covered patio is an extension of the building front's shed roof. She added that the patio roof was basically flat and would protrude outward at the same elevation as the shed roof on the right side of the entry doors. She said the patio also would have a fireplace, which would be constructed of brick. The brick in the fireplace and in the patio columns would be the same as the existing brick on the building; because some brick was being removed from where windows were being installed, that brick would be reused as much as possible. She explained that the existing front doors were made of wood and they had planned to refinish and reuse them, but later realized they could not be salvaged. Instead of the white front doors shown in the packet, Clift said they were now proposing a dark bronze color and showed the Commission of sample of the material and color. She said metal planters with legs were also shown in the packet and that they would be installed on the edge of the patio. She showed photos of some planters and said they would be fabricated and were similar to those shown in the photo. She said the patio roof would be a steel frame structure. She showed a photo of a similar patio at World of Beers in Greensboro.

Cooke added that they were proposing a natural gas fireplace, and Clift directed the Commission to a photo in the packet showing the covered patio at CharBar 7 in Greensboro. She said the fireplace proposed for Rio Grande would instead be brick, and also said the patio roof in the photo of CharBar would be similar to what was being proposed for Rio Grande.

Barbara Engel asked if the patio would be enclosed so it could be used in bad weather. Clift said no, although it might be at some point in the future. She said the patio could be used in rain but not in cold weather.

Caroline Ruch commented that she thought the dark bronze door color made a big difference over the white that was originally proposed. Clift said she thought the

doors would all be tied together with the dark bronze color and that the windows would all be white.

Engel asked if the planters would be like those shown in the photos, and Clift said yes, adding that the ones pictured were at The Traveled Farmer restaurant. Clift said she did not know what types of plants would be in the planters, and Cooke said they would probably be annuals.

Shoenfeld asked the Commission to cite the applicable parts of the Design Guidelines when discussing the findings of fact and asked all Commission members to help keep track of the findings. She suggested the Commission use the format of the staff report or the Design Guidelines. She said that the Commission should also refer to the Oak Ridge Commons Design Guidelines because the property is within Oak Ridge Commons.

For findings of fact, Shoenfeld said that the project meets the Design Guidelines.

Caroline Ruch made a motion to accept the staff report as part of the findings of fact. Kristin Kubly seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (4-0).

Caroline Ruch said that based on the findings of fact, she moved to approve COA-19-03A: Philip Cooke requested a COA to allow for construction of a covered outdoor patio at 2213 Oak Ridge Road, Oak Ridge, NC. The property is Guilford County Tax Parcel 166226, Oak Ridge Township, zoned CU-SC (Conditional Use-Shopping Center), SC (Scenic Corridor Overlay Zone), Historic District Overlay Zone, owned by Cooke Outparcel E, LLC. The scope of the work is to be as described in the COA application dated June 5, 2019, and as described in the applicant's presentation and responses to the Historic Preservation Commission at its meeting on June 19, 2019 using drawings, materials, samples, photos and colors as presented to the Commission. Kristin Kubly seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (4-0).

Shoenfeld congratulated the applicant.

6. COMMITTEE REPORTS/UPDATES

- A. **2018-19 budget update.** Shoenfeld went over the highlights of the annual budget.
- B. **2019-20 budget.** The 2019-20 budget year begins July 1.
- C. **Grant program.** Shoenfeld said that she had spoken with Jim Savage, chairman of the Board of Trustees at Oak Ridge Military Academy, who said they had been too busy to revise and complete the 2018-19 grant for Maple Glade. She said St. James AME Church would complete their grant requirements the weekend of June 22. She also said that grant award letters for the 2019-20 fiscal year had been sent out to recipients.
- D. **Historic inventory/Markers.** Shoenfeld said she, Town Clerk Sandra Smith and Intern Josh Schneider had been working on inventory sheets for all historic properties in the town. She said a meeting had been held with a graphic artist regarding a proposal to illustrate the Design Guidelines.

- E. Training.** None
- F. Communications outreach.** Shoenfeld said she would update the final numbers and issue a press release regarding the Historic Heritage Grants.
- G. Display case.** No report
- H. Coffee table book.** Shoenfeld said she was still gathering information. She added that she had interviewed Shawn Rogers, a local historian, and asked him for a proposal on a historic survey of properties outside the Historic District.

7. CITIZEN COMMENTS

None

8. ADJOURNMENT

Barbara Engel moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:28 p.m. Kristin Kubly seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (4-0).

Respectfully Submitted:

Sandra B. Smith, CMC, NCCMC
Town Clerk/HPC Staff

Deborah D. Shoenfeld
Chair