



**OAK RIDGE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
NOVEMBER 20, 2019 – 7:00 P.M.
OAK RIDGE TOWN HALL**

MINUTES

Members Present

Debbie Shoenfeld, Chair
Kristin Kubly
Paul Woolf
Barbara Engel, Alternate (Sitting)

Staff Present

Sandra Smith, Town Clerk
Sean Taylor, Planning Director

Members Absent

Caroline Ruch, Vice Chair
Brian Hall

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

Chair Debbie Shoenfeld called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. She welcomed meeting attendees, then explained the purpose of the Commission, which is to promote restoration and preservation of historic structures in Oak Ridge. The review is to ensure that any proposed changes are compatible with the special character of the Historic District.

2. APPROVE AGENDA

Debbie Shoenfeld made a motion to approve the amended meeting agenda to include tabling approval of the minutes of the September 18, 2019 regular meeting. Paul Woolf seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (4-0).

3. APPROVE MINUTES

This item was tabled.

4. OLD BUSINESS

A. Town Council report.

Shoenfeld gave the report at the November Town Council meeting, and she said she would also do it in December.

B. COAs reviewed/ approved at staff level.

None

C. COAs approved but not completed.

COAs outstanding are:

- COA-19-03 for Philip Cooke/Rio Grande's building elevation changes
- COA-19-03A for Philip Cooke/Rio Grande's outdoor patio and front doors
- COA-19-03B for Philip Cooke/Rio Grande's signage
- COA-19-05 for Gary and Myra Blackburn's fencing
- COA-19-06 for Matt and Brooke Kuzmick's new front porch
- COA-19-07 for Drew Donnell's project to replace the roof and repair the skylight
- COA-19-08 for Stanley and Denise Sacks' house
- COA-19-09 for Philip Cooke's car wash doors

D. Planning & Zoning Board meeting.

No issues related to the Historic District

E. Design review meetings.

None

F. Historic District violations.

None

5. NEW BUSINESS

Shoenfeld explained that the Commission would be following quasi-judicial procedures based on admitted evidence and sworn testimony. The suitability of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is based on conformance with the Design Guidelines and compatibility with the Historic District.

Shoenfeld said the Commission can only consider the size, scale, materials and other criteria described in the Design Guidelines. The Guidelines are intentionally broad to allow applicants a broad pathway toward compliance; the goal is to ensure that approved projects are compatible with the District and surrounding buildings. The Commission may approve, deny or continue consideration of a COA request, but a decision must be made within 180 days of the date the application was submitted. Appeals are heard by Oak Ridge Board of Adjustment; appeals from the Board of Adjustment are heard by Guilford County Superior Court.

Shoenfeld explained that Commission members should not engage in discussions with applicants regarding past or current COA applications and should not discuss the Commission's proceedings except with the Chair or Town staff.

Shoenfeld then explained what constituted a conflict of interest:

- A fixed opinion;

- Undisclosed *ex parte* communications with anyone about the case;
- A close familial, business or other relationship with an affected person; or
- A financial interest in the outcome of the case.

She asked if any Commission members had such a conflict with the COA to be discussed. Woolf, Kubly, Engel and Shoenfeld each individually indicated that they had no conflicts of interest.

COA-19-10: Oak Ridge Foundation, Inc. requests approval for signage at 2306 Oak Ridge Road in Oak Ridge Township. Being Guilford County Tax Parcel #0166219. The property is zoned CU-GB (Conditional Use-General Business), Scenic Corridor Overlay, Historic District Overlay, and it is owned by Oak Ridge Foundation, Inc.

Shoenfeld read the property description into the record and asked Commission members if they felt the project falls within the scope of the Design Guidelines and whether sufficient information has been submitted for the Commission to make a decision. All Commission members each individually indicated that their answers were yes.

Planning Director Sean Taylor asked that the staff report be accepted as submitted.

Dr. Steve Wilson, who was representing Oak Ridge Foundation, was sworn in by Town Clerk Sandra Smith. Wilson said the signage was for the flight simulation business that was located on the campus of Oak Ridge Military Academy and that it had been submitted by a sign company.

Shoenfeld asked if there would be any type of lighting on the sign. Wilson said only the flood lights that exist on the front of the building. Shoenfeld said if any new lighting was being considered it would need to be submitted for approval by the Commission. Wilson said he thought appropriate lighting was already in place. He said the signage consisted only of letters installed directly on the building and that it would not be lighted.

Shoenfeld called the Commission members' attention to the Design Guidelines. Woolf specifically pointed out page 33, Section B, subsection 1 regarding signage. Woolf said the request seemed to meet all of the signage requirements, including the items under the "Additionally Applicable to Commercial Signage" section on page 35. Shoenfeld agreed.

Kristin Kubly said she liked the font and thought it fit. Shoenfeld said the letters were 3- and 6-inches tall and made of acrylic. She said they were made of the same type material as has been used in other areas of the Historic District. Shoenfeld said the signage fits within the allowable square footage and meet the requirements in the guidelines.

Shoenfeld then called for the findings of fact.

Kristin Kubly moved to accept the staff report as findings of fact. She added that the application meets all the requirements of Section B., part 1 on signage and that it falls within

all Design Guidelines applicable to commercial signage. Paul Woolf seconded the motion, and it was approved unanimously (4-0).

Kristin Kubly made a motion, based on the findings of fact, to approve COA-19-10 for signage at 2306 Oak Ridge Road in Oak Ridge Township, Guilford County Tax Parcel #0166219. The property is zoned CU-GB (Conditional Use-General Business), Scenic Corridor Overlay, Historic District Overlay, and it is owned by Oak Ridge Foundation, Inc.

Shoenfeld congratulated the applicant.

6. COMMITTEE REPORTS/UPDATES

- A. **2019-20 budget.** Shoenfeld said the only item not shown was an additional ad for Christmas at Maple Glade.
- B. **Grant program.** Work was completed at the Charles Benbow house.
- C. **Historic inventory/Markers.** Shoenfeld asked to add Morning View School to the map of historic properties in the Town.
- D. **Training.** Commission members were reminded that they needed to attend one historic preservation training session per year. Some applicable training sessions might be available on YouTube.
- E. **Communications outreach.** Kubly had sent out press releases, and Shoenfeld said she and Ruch had been working on an ad for the Christmas at Maple Glade tour. Shoenfeld asked everyone to put the dates on their calendars.
- F. **Display case.** No report
- G. **Coffee table book.** Shoenfeld said this project might be able to move forward in the 2020-21 budget year.
- H. **Christmas at Maple Glade.** Shoenfeld announced that the winner of the raffle for the dinner and private tour for four was Marilyn Hall. She said much work had been done by designers on the tour, sponsors had been found for the kitchen, banners are nearly finished, and there is a desperate need for volunteers.

7. CITIZEN COMMENTS

- Steve Wilson, 8525 Scoggins Road, representing Oak Ridge Military Academy, thanked the Commission for what was going on at Maple Glade. He said the money raised will go back to help restore the old house, and he is excited for what is being done. Wilson expressed his appreciation to the Commission.

8. ADJOURNMENT

Kristin Kubly moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:26 p.m. Barbara Engel seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (4-0).

Respectfully Submitted:

Sandra B. Smith, CMC, NCCMC
Town Clerk/HPC Staff

Deborah D. Shoenfeld
Chair