



**OAK RIDGE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING  
MARCH 15, 2017 – 7:00 P.M.  
OAK RIDGE TOWN HALL**

**MINUTES**

**Members Present**

Ann Schneider, Chair  
Debbie Shoenfeld, Vice Chair  
Caroline Ruch  
Kristin Kubly  
Paul Woolf, Alternate (Sitting)

**Staff Present**

Bill Bruce, Planning Director  
Sandra Smith, Town Clerk

**1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER**

Chair Ann Schneider called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. She welcomed meeting attendees and introduced Commission members and staff. Schneider then explained the purpose and goals of the Commission, which is to see that any proposed changes are compatible with the special character of the Historic District and the surrounding buildings.

**2. APPROVE AGENDA**

**Debbie Shoenfeld** made a **motion** to approve the agenda after adding Design Review Meetings as an item under Old Business. **Kristin Kubly** seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (5-0).

**3. APPROVE MINUTES**

**Debbie Shoenfeld** made a **motion** to approve the minutes of the January 18, 2017 meeting and February 8, 2017 special meeting. **Caroline Ruch** seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (5-0).

**4. OLD BUSINESS**

**A. Town Council report.** Schneider presented the report at the February and March Town Council meetings. She volunteered to present in April, and Shoenfeld volunteered to draft the report.

**B. COAs reviewed/ approved at staff level.**

Staff approved a vegetable garden fence at 2412 Oak Ridge Road for Steven Lantz and Tony Cooler.

**C. COAs approved but not completed.**

Carolina Urgent Care, located in the commercial building at Marketplace Shopping Center, is open. COAs not completed include painting at L&T Small Engine Repair, and the houses in Oak Ridge Plantation and Barrow Place.

**D. Design Review Meetings.**

Schneider reported she and Shoenfeld had met with the new architect on the proposed Pugh Oil building, and she felt they were well on their way to a good COA application. Planning Director Bill Bruce said they intended to submit the COA application to be heard in April.

**5. NEW BUSINESS**

**A. Discussion of recommendation of Paul Woolf as full HPC member.**

**Debbie Shoenfeld** made a **motion** to recommend that the Town Council appoint Paul Woolf as a full member of the Commission. **Kristin Kubly** seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (5-0).

\* \* \*

Schneider stated that the Design Guidelines are designed to provide recommendations for design aesthetics within the Oak Ridge Historic District and are intentionally broad to allow applicants a broad pathway toward compliance, with the goal of ensuring approved projects are compatible with the District and the surrounding buildings. Schneider said the Commission would conduct a quasi-judicial evidentiary hearing with sworn testimony, which means each Commission member acts as an independent judge and a member of the Commission. She said Commission members are each tasked with being impartial, without taking the opinions of themselves or others into account, and that all applications must be approved, denied or continued within 180 days. She stated that appeals of the Commission's decisions are heard by the Board of Adjustment; appeals of Board of Adjustment decisions are heard by Guilford County Superior Court.

Schneider then asked if Commission members had any conflicts of interest: A fixed opinion; undisclosed ex parte communications with anyone about the case; a close familial, business or other relationship with an affected person; or a financial interest in the outcome of the case. Commission members Caroline Ruch, Kristin Kubly, Debbie Shoenfeld and Paul Woolf indicated they had no conflicts. Schneider said she had none, but disclosed that she had attended a Planning & Zoning Board meeting in which one of the COAs to be heard was discussed.

**B. COA CASE # 17-02:** Johnson and Lee LLC requests approval of a new single-family residence. The property is located at 8430 Linville Road in Oak Ridge Township. It is Guilford County Tax Parcel #0222368, is zoned RS40, Historic District Overlay, and is owned by Johnson and Lee LLC.

Schneider read the property description, then asked Commission members to confirm the eligibility of the project, whether it fell within the scope of the Design

Guidelines, and whether they had sufficient information to make findings of fact and render a decision. Commission members agreed by consensus that they did.

Town Clerk Sandra Smith swore in speakers for all COAs on the agenda, which included Commie Johnson and Rick Lee of Johnson and Lee and Planning Director Bill Bruce.

Rick Lee said he had submitted the project narrative and other information, and had tried to meet the requirements of the Design Guidelines. He noted that this would not be a brick house (as the other houses in Barrow Place had been).

Schneider asked the Commission to cite the applicable sections of the Design Guidelines in their deliberations. She said this was clearly a Craftsman-style house, and that it was wonderful that it was not another brick house in the subdivision. Shoenfeld and Ruch agreed.

In response to a question from Ruch, Johnson pointed out the sample of the rock. Woolf asked where the stone was located, and Lee said on the bottom of the tapered columns. Kubly asked if the foundation would be made of brick, and Lee said yes. Ruch asked if there would be a chimney, and Lee said no.

Ruch said she thought the design achieved the look of the Craftsman-style house across the road (John Brown house), and Johnson said even the windows were designed like those on the Brown house. Schneider agreed that the house was a traditional arts-and-crafts-style house.

Schneider asked Bruce if they were waiting on information for the HVAC or mechanical systems. Bruce said they would be located in the rear of the house but needed to be screened, so more information was needed. Lee said they could definitely place the heating and air systems in the back of the house.

Ruch asked if there would be windows in the garage door, and Lee said he had submitted a cut sheet of the door to be used. He said windows were not shown in the garage door on the plan elevations, but they were shown on the cut sheet, which is what would be used. Ruch said there were a minimal number of windows on that side of the house, and she thought it would help to include windows in the garage door so that side of the house did not have such a solid void of windows.

Schneider said she was happy with the architectural details fulfilling the Design Guidelines.

Kubly asked if the roof covering the front porch was made of metal. Lee said it was a standing seam metal roof like is on the Barrow-Brown house just up the road, except it is green and the one proposed for this house is black. He added that the metal roof would be on the porch only.

Shoenfeld said she would venture to say that the design of the house and the materials proposed to be used are all within the Design Guidelines. Schneider agreed, saying she thought the plan reflected the design principles of balance and

variety, and that the house is handsome and well proportioned aesthetically and in terms of being compatible with the Historic District.

Shoenfeld said she felt the same way about the lighting proposed for the outside of the house, and that it was definitely the style that would be used on a Craftsman-style house and that it was appropriate. Ruch agreed.

Shoenfeld said she thought the last thing that needed to be considered was the landscaping. Woolf asked if two trees were being removed for the septic area. Lee said yes, but that they are both leaning and need to be removed. Because the septic area will be to the left of the house, only those two trees will need to be removed, he said. Schneider asked if the landscaping requirements are met by the plan, and Bruce said there are no requirements in the development ordinance for landscaping a residential lot. Ruch said she liked the fact that there would be shade trees in the front yard along the road, which she felt was good in the Historic District.

Lee pointed out that the garage door would be the same gray color as the shake siding. Schneider said she thought that would be handsome.

Schneider then outlined the findings of fact to include:

- The staff report
- The building appears compatible with the Historic District as a Craftsman-style home and in terms of its architectural details, and it includes similar features to those on existing buildings in the District
- Windows are to be included in the garage door
- The HVAC is to be located in rear of the house

**Kristin Kubly** made a **motion** to accept the findings of fact as stated. **Caroline Ruch** seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (5-0).

**Debbie Shoenfeld** made a **motion** to approve COA # 17-02 to allow for construction of a new, single-family residence at 8430 Linville Road in Oak Ridge Township, being Guilford County Tax Parcel #0222368, zoned RS-40, Historic District Overlay, and owned by Johnson and Lee LLC. The scope of the project is to be constructed as described in the COA application dated February 15, 2017, and in related information, testimony and the staff report, and includes the findings of fact which specify that windows are to be included in the garage door and HVAC is to be located in the rear of the house, and using materials/colors, drawings and photos as presented to the Historic Preservation Commission on March 15, 2017. **Paul Woolf** seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (5-0).

**C. COA CASE # 17-03:** The Town of Oak Ridge requests approval of a new parking lot in Oak Ridge Town Park. The property is located at 8326 Linville Road in Oak Ridge Township, is Guilford County Tax Parcel #0166249, zoned CU-PI (Conditional Use-Public Institutional), Historic District Overlay, and is owned by Town of Oak Ridge.

Schneider read the property description, then asked Commission members to confirm the eligibility of the project, whether it fell within the scope of the Design Guidelines, and whether they had sufficient information to make findings of fact and render a decision. Commission members agreed by consensus that they did.

Woolf asked where the entrance would be, and Bruce said it was just past the park and just before the gravel driveway that leads to the cell tower. Shoenfeld asked if the driveway would swing around Linville Road at an angle. On the map, Bruce pointed out the location of the Redmon house, the pond, and other facilities in that area of the park on the map and how the driveway and parking lot would be situated. He said the parking lot was designed to serve the new playground, picnic shelter 2 and the area where future tennis courts will be located. Town Clerk Smith said the parking lot would serve what has traditionally been an underutilized side of the park because there is nowhere to park there now.

Schneider asked how many spaces are in the large parking lot, and Bruce said at least three times the amount to be located in this smaller lot. Ruch asked if community events would still be able to be held in the Redmon Field if tennis courts are built, and Smith said some community events may need to be moved elsewhere in the park. Shoenfeld pointed out that there would still be a good deal of open space along Linville Road at the front of the park. Schneider asked where the new ball fields would be located, and Smith and Bruce explained that they would be located on the west side of the Redmon House where the other ball fields are currently located.

Woolf asked if the new parking lot area would be lit, and Bruce said yes but details were not known at this time. He said a lighting plan will be submitted for approval by the Commission in the future.

Schneider said she had no problems with the application, and Shoenfeld agreed. Schneider said she could see no issue about compatibility with the surrounding area because the request is for a parking lot for a park that already has a large parking lot.

Ruch said the plan meets the requirements for landscaping, and Schneider said she liked all the trees shown on the plan. Bruce said the trees planted around the parking lot would provide lots of shady places to park.

**Debbie Shoenfeld** made a **motion** to accept the staff report as the findings of fact. **Paul Woolf** seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (5-0).

**Debbie Shoenfeld** made a **motion** to approve COA # 17-03 to allow for construction of a new parking lot. The property is located at 8326 Linville Road in Oak Ridge Township, is Guilford County Tax Parcel #0166249, zoned CU-PI (Conditional Use-Public Institutional), Historic District Overlay, and is owned by Town of Oak Ridge. The scope of work is to be as described in the COA application dated March 1, 2017, and as described in the applicant's presentation and responses to the Historic Preservation Commission at its meeting on March 15, 2017 and in the drawing as presented. **Paul Woolf** seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (5-0).

**D. Approval of revised HPC Rules of Procedure.**

Commission members reviewed the proposed revised Rules of Procedure. Schneider said she had created the proposed document from the comments made by

Commission members when the matter was discussed a couple of months previously. She added that she had a red line copy which showed the specific changes if anyone wanted to see it, and she went through the changes that had been made. She noted that the Rules of Procedures would be also be sent for a final review by the attorney, although no further substantive changes were expected.

After additional discussion, **Paul Woolf** made a **motion** to accept the revised HPC Rules of Procedure. **Debbie Shoenfeld** seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (5-0).

**6. COMMITTEE REPORTS/UPDATES**

**A. 2016-17 budget update.**

**B. Grant program.**

Schneider reported that grant information session had been held and six residents attended. She outlined a couple of the proposed projects, and said the review panel would meet on May 1.

**C. Communication outreach.**

Schneider said an ad would appear in the Northwest Finder commemorating the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Historic District.

**D. Historic Inventory/Markers.**

Shoenfeld said the date for the dedication of the Benbow/Stafford Farm historic marker was needed. HPC members agreed by consensus to hold the dedication on June 1 immediately before the Town Council meeting.

**E. Historic Oak Ridge Celebration.**

Schneider said good progress was being made on the event and noted several property owners who were considering participating. The planning meetings are being held the second Wednesday of each month and are open to the public.

**F. Display case.**

Town Clerk Sandra Smith reported the display will be on the Oak Ridge Horse Show has been completed.

**G. Training.**

None scheduled at this time

**7. CITIZEN COMMENTS**

None

8. **ADJOURNMENT**

**Paul Woolf** made a **motion** to adjourn the meeting at 8:18 p.m. **Kristin Kubly** seconded the motion, and it was passed unanimously (5-0).